

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE DISTRICT NEW MEXICO**

THE CINCINNATI INSURANCE COMPANY,	)	
	)	
Plaintiff,	)	
	)	
v.	)	No. Civ. 18-981 JCH-SCY
	)	
DESERT STATE LIFE MANAGEMENT;	)	
CHRISTOPHER MOYA, in his capacity as	)	
Receiver for the receivership estate of DESERT	)	
STATE LIFE MANAGEMENT; PAUL A.	)	
DONISTHORPE; and CAMERON GRAHAM as	)	
trustee for ANDREW GRAHAM, JOSEPH	)	
PEREZ, CHARLES REYNOLDS on behalf J.W.,	)	
VINCENT ESQUIBEL, and ISAAC BLACK on	)	
behalf of and as trustee for JEFFREY BLACK, on	)	
behalf of themselves and all others similarly	)	
situated;	)	
	)	
Defendants.	)	

**JOINT REPORT REGARDING STATUS OF SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT**

Pursuant to the September 9, 2021 Order of Judge Judith C. Herrera, the parties submit this status report regarding the status of the final settlement agreement.

The Settlement Agreement, which involves the settlement of *Graham v. Desert State, et al.*, case number 20cv956 in the Second Judicial District Court and third-party complaint filed therein by Paul Donisthorpe against Cincinnati Insurance and Evanston Insurance; this insurance coverage litigation; the *Evanston v. Desert State Life Management, et al.* insurance coverage litigation, Case No. 18-cv-00654 in this court; and *Graham v. Evanston Ins. Co.*, Case No. D-202-cv-2020-04888 in the Second Judicial District Court was fully executed by all parties.

The settlement of this litigation is subject to the approval of the settlement by the Second Judicial District Court in the class action lawsuit *Graham v. Desert State, et al.*, case number

20cv956 in the Second Judicial District Court and to class certification by that court, the entry of a final approval order, in addition to the other conditions set forth in the settlement agreement.

On August 23, 2021, Judge Joshua A. Allison entered the final order approving the Settlement Agreement in the *Graham v. Desert State, et al.* class action lawsuit. Pursuant to the Settlement Agreement, the Effective Date of this settlement will be September 23, 2021. Pursuant to the Settlement Agreement, the settlement must be funded by Cincinnati and Evanston Insurance Company no later than fourteen days thereafter, that is, by October 7, 2021. The parties agreed in the Settlement Agreement that Cincinnati shall file a notice of voluntary dismissal with prejudice of this action within seven calendar days after full funding of the initial \$1.8 million settlement fund.

Based on the foregoing, Cincinnati anticipates that it will be in a position to file a notice of voluntary dismissal with prejudice of this action on October 14, 2021.

**Plaintiff, The Cincinnati Insurance Company**

By its counsel:

PETERS & NYE LLP

By: /s/ Nancy K. Tordai (Submitted Electronically  
9/17/2021)

Nancy K. Tordai  
(admitted *pro hac vice*/IL Bar No. 6182953)  
Peters & Nye LLP  
14 Executive Court, Suite 2  
South Barrington, IL 60010  
Tel: (847) 423-0353; Fax: (847)381-1693  
nancytordai@petersnye.com

Scott & Kienzle, P.A.  
Paul M. Kienzle III, N.M. Bar #7592  
P.O. Box 587

Albuquerque, NM 87103  
505/246-8600; Fax 505/246-8682  
paul@kienzlelaw.com

**Defendant, Desert State Life Management and Christopher Moya, in his capacity as Receiver for the receivership estate of Desert State Life Management**

By their counsel:

/s/ Kevin A. Graham

Kevin A. Graham  
COUNSEL FOR CHRISTOPHER MOYA,  
in Defendant Moya's capacity as Receiver for the  
receivership estate for DESERT STATE LIFE  
MANAGEMENT  
New Mexico Regulation and Licensing Department  
PO Box 25101  
Santa Fe, NM 87504  
(505) 476-4562  
Kevin.Graham@state.nm.us

/s/ Joshua A. Spencer

Financial Institutions Division  
2520 Cerrillos Road  
Sante Fe, NM 87505  
(505)476-4692  
JoshuaSpencer2@state.nm.us

**Defendants, CAMERON GRAHAM as trustee for ANDREW GRAHAM, JOSEPH PEREZ, CHARLES REYNOLDS on behalf J.W., VINCENT ESQUIBEL, and ISAAC BLACK on behalf of and as trustee for JEFFREY BLACK, on behalf of themselves and all others similarly situated**

By their counsel:

FREEDMAN BOYD HOLLANDER  
GOLDBERG URIAS & WARD P.A.

/s/ Frank T. Davis

Joseph Goldberg  
David H. Urias  
H. Jesse Jacobus  
Frank T. Davis  
20 First Plaza, Suite 700

Albuquerque, NM 87102  
P: 505-842-9960  
F: 505-842-0761  
jg@fbdlaw.com  
dhu@fbdlaw.com  
hjj@fbdlaw.com  
ftd@fbdlaw.com

**Defendant, Paul A. Donisthorpe**

By His Counsel:

THE VARGAS LAW FIRM, LLC

/s/ Ray M. Vargas, II  
Ray M. Vargas  
807 Silver Ave., S.W.  
Albuquerque, NM 87102  
P: 505-242-1670  
ray@vargaslawfirmabq.com

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on September 17, 2021 I filed the foregoing pleading electronically through the CM/ECF system, causing it to be served by electronic means on all counsel of record.

/s/ Nancy K. Tordai  
Nancy K. Tordai